GOVERNMENTALITY AND TECHNIQUES OF THE SELF IN THE PRESBYTERIAN MISSIONS IN 19TH-CENTURY TAIWAN[1].

Edgar Zavala Pelayo

El Colegio de México

Abstract: The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (PCT) can be regarded as the most politically active church in contemporary Taiwan. Originally established by British and Canadian missionaries in the second half of the 19th century, the PCT developed into a network of institutions and agents that played an active political role during Taiwan's Kuomintang regime and the ensuing period of democratization in the second half of the 20th century. This paper reports preliminary findings of an exploratory analysis on the "techniques of the self" at work in the 19th-century Presbyterian missions in Taiwan. The analysis draws on a critical governmentality perspective and focuses on the techniques of the self in both foreign missionaries and the missions' native workers during the 1865-1895 period, that is, from the establishment of the first English mission in the south of Taiwan to the year when the Japanese colonial government begins in the island. The analysis shed lights on what can be regarded the early *missionary governmentality* of the PCT. The conclusions point very preliminary findings on three different techniques of self that do not seem to rely strongly on practices of self-examination but instead on a self formed through techniques substantially, and counter-intuitively, associated to *networks of internal and external o/Others*. Other possible sources of techniques of self, both "foreign" and "local" (e.g. Confucianist) are also pointed in the conclusions as promising research subjects that could yield further insights into the governmentality at work in the 19th-century Taiwan's Presbyterian missions.

I. Introduction

The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan and its contemporary political relevance

The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (PCT henceforth) is part of the minority Christian religions in Taiwan –see Table 1 below. According to the PCT's figures from 2009, the

[1] This project was supported by a research grant from the Center for Chinese Studies, at Taiwan's National Central Library. My explorations of the Presbyterian Church and religion in Taiwan were greatly assisted by professors Hung-Chieh Chang, Chi-Rong Chen, Yuki-Takai Heller, Yang-En Cheng, Kuo-hsien Su, Ke-hsien Huang and Jonathan Seitz. I also thank the ever-professional assistance of Li-Chen Chao and Chi-Ming Lu during my visits to the PCT's archives in Taipei and Tainan. The biases and errors in this paper remain my own.

church has about 1,205 congregations that comprise about 238,372 members (PCT(a), n.d.). More recent estimates suggest the PCT totals about 240,000 members distributed in about 1,200 congregations (Seitz 2016) –the former figure representing roughly 1% of Taiwan's population. Despite its comparatively small size in quantitative terms, the PCT can be regarded not only as the oldest Christian church in the country but also one of the most active churches, if not the most active, in contemporary Taiwan's political field. It has been described as a public supporter of Taiwan's independence, electoral reform, religious freedom, and human rights (Kuo 2008; Laliberte 2017), especially after its public political interventions in Kuomintang-ruled Taiwan during the second half of the 20th century.

The arrival of the Kuomintang (KMT) leaders to Taiwan in the 1940s and the implementation of nationalist policies aimed at (re-)constructing "the one real and authentic China" (Rubinstein 2003: 217) in Taiwan, put the PCT in an awkward and relatively constrained position as a church that had soon after its inception in the 1860s identified as Taiwanese and used Taiwanese language in its everyday operations. The KMT's martial law and a series of international events soon triggered the PCT's political involvement. Fearing that the US diplomacy would encourage the Communist Party in China to take over Kuomintang-led Taiwan, the PCT issued in 1971 the "Statement on our national faith" a bold public call that advocated Taiwan's right "to determine its own destiny" (PCT(b): n.p.). and was addressed explicitly to the leaders of the Republic of China. This statement was followed by a "Statement on our national fate" in 1972, a *de facto* theological justification of the PCT's self-acknowledged political role. A series of confrontations between the church and the state ensued. In 1977, the PCT issued "A declaration of human rights" addressed to then president of the United States Jimmy Carter as well as countries and churches "throughout the world". In this document the PCT refers to "the possibility of an invasion by Communist China" and restates its "goal of independence and freedom for the people of Taiwan" (PCT(c): n.p.). In 1980 Kao Chun-ming and Si Sui-Hun, the general secretary of the PCT and the latter´s assistant respectively, were imprisoned after giving assistance to participants in the political demonstrations that took place in December 10th 1979, also known as the Kaohsiung Incident (Seitz, forthcoming). The above and other associated political events in which the PCT has performed a central role have made this church a relevant object of public debates in Taiwan, and scholarly discussions on both sides of the Pacific. The church has been referred to as "an important incubator of social movements" (Simon 2017: 246),as well as the "self-anointed conscience of the Republic of China" (Rubinstein 1991b: 88) and "advocate of Taiwanese selfhood" (Rubinstein 2003: 206).

Table 1. Religious denominations in contemporary Taiwan

Religion	Percentage
Christian	5.5
Folk religion	49.3
Buddhism	14
No religion	13.2
Daoism	12.4
Local Religions (e.g. Yiguandao)	2.3
Catholicism	1.3
Japanese religion	0.5

Adapted from 2018 Taiwan Social Change Survey

A (very) short historical outline

Whereas the PCT's most visible political activism has taken place in the second half of the 20th century, the church's history dates back to the 1860s, and intertwines with the 19th century's wave of European and North American Protestant missions, more specifically, the Protestant missionary movement in Great Britain and Canada. To address this historical period it is worth recalling that as part of their 19-century colonial-commercial expansionism, Great Britain and later, Great Britain and France, engaged respectively in the first (1839-1842) and second (1856-1860) "Opium Wars" against China. After defeating the Qing dynasty, a series of treaties where signed by the parties. The treaty of Tianjin signed in 1858 granted foreign powers a series of concessions, which included the right to reside and carry out trade in the mainland Chinese ports of Chefoo, Chinkiang, Hankow, Kiukang, Kiungchow, Newchwang, Swatow, as well as Tainan and Tamsui in Taiwan (Nield 2010). More importantly, this treaty also allowed foreign powers to send Christian missionaries to the opened ports. The treaty of Tianjin was ratified by the Convention of Peking in 1860 and, as a result, the ports of Tainan, Takou (present-day Kaoshiung) and Keelung in the north of Taiwan soon saw groups of British nationals residing in the area and carrying out trading, commerce and miscellaneous consular activities (Gardella 2015: 167).

The first presbyterian missionary, Dr. James Laidlaw Maxwell, thus arrived to Taiwan in 1865 and, after a forced temporary stay at Takao, established the headquarters of a British Presbyterian mission in Tainan. Presbyterian missionary Hugh Ritchie, from England as well, joined Dr. Maxwell by the end of 1867 and both became the first agents of the British Presbyterian Church's missionary enterprise in the south of Formosa. In 1875 they were joined by George Leslie Mackay, a missionary sent by the Canadian Presbyterian Church, who decided after some considerations to establish his missionary base in Tamsui, at the north of the island. These missionaries slowly but steadily made their way into the then Taiwanese frontier society. Sharing the evangelical zeal and approaches of other Protestant missions in China and other Asian regions, Canadian George L. Mackay in the north and the group of British missionaries in the south of the island engaged in itinerant preaching,

erected chapels in the island's growing cities and rural villages, and established small hospitals and elementary schools for boys and girls.

The sudden arrival of the Japanese colonial regime in the second half of the 1890s – the result of the Treaty of Shimoneky, which ended the 1894-1895 war between the Qing Dinasty and the Japanese Empire over the Korean territory – brought changes and new rules for the operation of the Presbyterian missions, particularly its schools. However, the early years of the Japanese regime did not translate into major conflicts. Conversely, the colonial regime regarded the Presbyterian missions and educational institutions as aids in its plans for transforming Taiwan's insular society into a modern one (Rubinstein 2003). Presbyterian missionaries even performed as successful mediators between the newly-arrived colonial agents and the Taiwanese population who was understandably upset at the Japanese intrusion (Lin 1999). The decade before the regime's dissolution in 1945 saw the Japanese colonial government issuing a new set of policies that included the compulsory teaching and practice of Shintoism in all schools. This policy was part of a more aggressive colonial program that eventually ended in the eviction from the Island of foreign Presbyterians and even the seizure of the church's properties. Despite this temporary drawback, the Presbyterian Church in the first half of the 20th century had grown into a strong Christian church that multiplied its chapels across the country, institutionalized its medical services through a network of hospitals and diversified its educational services by establishing institutions for secondary and theological education as well as schools for women. Such an institutional diversification proved indeed helpful for the church´s political activism in the second half of the 20th century. The sections below address not the PCT's period of institutional development but its 19th-century early missionary period. This foundational period is approached through a governmentality perspective and focuses on an exploration of the techniques of subjectification or techniques of the self (Foucault 1993, 2014; Molina 2008; Petterson 2014; Tilli 2019) that were at work in the early Presbyterian missions. The exploration of these techniques is presented in the sections below as a first step towards understanding the missionary governmentality of the Presbyterian Church in 19th century Taiwan.

II. Outline of Works on The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan

The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan has attracted the attention of a number of researchers and scholars. The lines below are not presented as an in-depth review of that diverse literature but rather as a rough outline of different approaches. Some of the studies on the PCT have been historical in nature and their specific research subjects have ranged from the PCT's work among mountain tribes in Taiwan in the first half of the 20th century (Cheng 1965) and the Church's missionary activity in the early post-war period (Chou (2015), to the civic nationalism of the PCT during the second half of the 20th century (Masláková 2016). Some of these historical studies, and others that are based on theological perspectives, have been evaluative in nature and have analyzed normatively the

performance of the PCT in different areas. Seitz (2016) evaluates the unity within the church, and the institutional sources of such unity. Masláková (2019) examines the PCT's contributions to the Taiwanese national identity and its support for the country's independence from mainland China. Rubinstein has assessed the transition of the PCT and other Protestant denominations in Taiwan from "transplanted" to "Indigenous" churches (1991) and has reviewed the PCT's role, and challenges, in the democratization of the Taiwanese society from the early to the later decades of the 20th century (2001, 2003). Cheng (2009) has traced the positive influence of the Calvinist tradition throughout the history of the PCT.

From an evaluative stance as well, other studies have adopted a synchronic approach and have assessed the contemporary performance of the PCT in areas such as the application in practice of Calvinist theology (Wang, Ling, Wang 1999) or the attitudes on foreign missions found in the international students enrolled at PCT's educational institutions (Alexander 2015).

Other works have focused on the lives of the PCT's early missionaries in the second half of the 19th century. Some of these works, particularly the oldest volumes, have been published as auto-biographical volumes (Mackay 1895; Band 1936) or as literary and hagiographic narratives (Campbell 1915, Keith 1912, Mackay 1913). Other biographical works have approached the life of missionaries from more analytical perspectives, being the Canadian missionary George Leslie Mackay one of the most frequent research subjects. Specific study objects have ranged from Mackay's proselytization strategies (Chang 2016), to the influence that Scottish and Canadian cultural values (Van Die 2012) as well as 19th-century Victorian science (Forsberg 2012) had on Mackay's upbringing and adult life respectively. The charismatic quality of Mackay's missionary profile (Rohrer 2008) and even the multi-functional spatiality of his mission stations (Tseng, Chang, Mii, and Chien 2015) can also be counted among the specific research subjects regarding the PCT.

III. A Governmentality Approach

The analytical approach of the study whose preliminary results I present below draws on the theoretical-analytical framework of governmentality (Foucault 2007). Like most of the works cited in the section above, a governmentality framework and genealogical approach utilize archives, historical records and documents as main empirical references, being patterns of discourses and practices of government (Dean 2010) the chief phenomena under study. In addition to having discourses and practices of government as main empirical object, and unlike the majority of the works cited above, a governmentality perspective can be described as meta-institutional or *outward-looking* in such a way that it directs the analyst's gaze beyond the governmental institution's inner composition and self-referential justification and instead pays attention to the series of agencies, regimes, programs, conventions and traditions that, legitimately or not, sanctioned or not (Foucault 1977), traverse the institution and are thus substantially involved in the government of individuals,

groups and/or collectivities. In other words, a governmentality perspective approaches government in a broad sense and displays a non-normative gaze which goes beyond societies' strictly political-governmental dimension.

Foucault addressed the state and government in contemporary Western societies by displaying the theoretical-analytical perspective roughly outlined above. His preliminary findings suggested the prevalence of a complex *governmentality* (Foucault 2007) that has been the result of miscellaneous governmental regimes that were once active and have transformed, lightly or radically, over the centuries in the West. One of the most discussed of such regimes has been biopower, or the emergence, and consequent government, of the birth rate, mortality and health of human populations (biopolitics) as well as the bodies, body movements and bodily performance of individuals (anatomopolitics) (Foucault 1978). Another element in Foucault's governmentality (2008) has been the 17th-18th centuries program of classical liberalism and its anthropology of the *homo oeconomicus*, as well as the more recent traditions of liberalism and ordoliberalism in 20th century Western societies. A certainly less discussed element is Foucault's explorations of the religious element in Western governmentality/ies (2007), that is, the set of governmental principles that he identified in the handbooks and the "rules" of monastic institutions in medieval and pre-medieval Europe. Foucault called this set of religious principles of government "pastoralism" or "pastoral power" (2007), which includes, for instance, the principle of "analytical responsibility" (2007: 169-70), that is, the pastor's permanent surveillance and registry of the thoughts and acts of each member of his flock; or the principle of all and everyone (*omnes et singulatim*), that is, the pastor's pervasive individualization of every individual under his care on the one hand and a totalizing surveillance of the whole flock on the other hand (2011). Christian pastoralism would cease to operate in Western societies after the emergence of a secular reason of state in the 16th and 17th centuries; however, some of the traits of pastoralism, such as its individualizing and totalizing nature over individuals and groups, could still be found in the states and state institutions of contemporary societies.

Another major component of a governmentality perspective is its *inward-looking* analysis of the formation of the subject. The works on the self by the late Foucault are often taken as focused exclusively on the *ethics* of the subject or the *care* of the self. What is often missed is that Foucault did point the substantial link between governmentality and his analyses of the self in the Greek and Christian traditions. As he explains in one of his lectures in 1980:

> The contact point, where the individuals are driven by others is tied to the way they conduct themselves, is what we can call, I think, government. Governing people, in the broad meaning of the word, […] is not a way to force people to do what the governor wants; it is always a versatile equilibrium, with complementarity and conflicts between techniques which assure coercion and processes through which the self is constructed or modified by himself (1993: 203-4)

The word "government" in some of Foucault's compendiums of lectures on the self that were published posthumously (2010, 2014) are not a casual editorial choice. In this sense it is worth recalling Weber's (2001) classic analysis on the Calvinist ethic and the spirit of capitalism. Granted, Weber's analysis of Calvinism was not aimed at tracing the genealogy of the Western subject (Foucault 2010, 2014); however, this work was, like Foucault's genealogical exercises, a non-normative study on the unacknowledged "historical significance of the [religious] dogma" (2001: 58) and the dogma´s "psychological sanctions" and consequent influences on individuals' "practical conduct" (2001: 55)[2].

To sum up, a governmentality perspective on religions allows the analysts to display both an outward-looking view and an inward-looking gaze. The former allows for the location, and placing, of religions' explicit or implicit governmental models across a broad and complex field of non-political governmental regimes; the latter allows grasping the range of governmental effects that religious discourses and practices have on the formation of subjectivities and the constitution and conduct of the self. The Foucauldian governmentality, his concept of pastoralism and even his earlier analyses of disciplinary institutions, have been differently adopted and adapted to a number of analyses on religions and associated phenomena. Below I outline some of those works.

IV. Governmentality, Calvinism and Presbyterianism

In his Foucauldian comparative analysis of Christian traditions, regimes of discipline and self-discipline and the emergence of states in Northern Europe, Gorski (2003) recalls Weber's emphasis on Calvinism's pre-destination, but notes that Calvinism also contained "an ethic of self-discipline" put in practice through "techniques" such as "regular Bible reading, daily journals, moral log books, and rigid control over time" (2003: 20). In addition, Calvinism emphasized the establishment of consistories, that is, elected bodies whose main activity was "to supervise the morals of the congregation" (2003: 21). For this Protestant tradition individual's discipline was worthless with a corresponding "communal discipline" (2003: 124).

Other authors have analyzed the pastoral power within Presbyterianism. For Mutch (2016), the Scottish tradition of Presbyterianism embodies a form of power that works by stressing an "order" in organizational and institutional affairs. A parallel principle of Presbyterian power is its reliance on "self-examination", one that was carried out not through confession before priests but through self-reflexive practices such as diary writing. Self-examination

[2] On the other hand, as a relatively convinced modernist, Weber believed that religions had undergone a "great historic process [of] development" consisting in the gradual "elimination of magic from the world", a process he saw starting in "the old Hebrew prophets […] in conjunction with Hellenistic scientific thought", and developing more fully via, indeed, the Calvinist idea of predestination (2001: 61).

and the practice of diary writing were also linked to the principle of "accountability" which Mutch describes as the driver of Presbyterianism's emphasis on recording and record keeping –from sinful thoughts in diaries to the decisions and finances of the church's presbyteries and other ecclesiastical bodies legalese. Mutch (2015) has also linked Presbyterianism's self-examination and the technique of diary writing to 19th-century instances of liberal thought and Victorian reformers such as Samuel Smiles, author of the then popular book Self-help and endorser of self-improvement as social value.

In a further analysis on the religious genealogy of managerial capitalism McKinlay and Mutch (2015) point how the influential practice of self-examination through diary writing in the Presbyterian tradition was not necessarily for the writer's "solace" but for his/her expression of "deep unease" (2015: 245) towards spiritual issues including predestination. These authors also point the substantial connection between the individual's accountability and the "collective accountability" (215: 245) of the church and its different branches of activities. This organizational accountability consisted of "detailed recording, careful categorisation and precise analysis", and at times "obsessively detailed" registries (2015: 246, 250), practices and instruments that were crucial, as even the enforcement of church discipline –e.g. the punishment of sinners – and the taking of discipline-related decisions relied on everyday "accounting routines" (2015: 247).

V. Methodological notes

A governmentality approach is often based on a genealogical research strategy. Drawing on Nietzsche's genealogical critiques, Foucault proposed a series of theoretical-methodological principles that can orient the analysis of historical material. In his often-cited "methodological" text on Nietzsche and genealogies, he (1977) endorses caution over teleological and progressive accounts of the past that portray a linear, and triumphalist march of history. He also warns against an exclusive focus on official histories and the use of "noble" sources. Instead he suggests the analysis of both official, sanctioned knowledges and local, peripheral and apparently incomplete knowledges, as it is the latter which can give an account of marginal, yet influential phenomena in the course of history. For a genealogical approach to be fully operational the principles above have to be supplemented with more operative methods.

In general terms, the qualitative analysis of documentary and archival material whose preliminary results are presented below was carried through three-stage readings: a literal reading to identify frequent explicit themes within and across documents, an interpretive reading to identify frequent implicit themes and discursive patterns within and across documents and a preliminary conceptual-theoretical reading, whereby some of the results of the second stage were linked to the governmentality approach and the specialized literature roughly described above.

The sources of the documentary and archival materials that were collected and analyzed comprise both what can be regarded as "central" as well as "peripheral" sources. The former include sources such as the well-known periodical of the English Presbyterian

Church "The Messenger" (1850-1947), familiar books written by missionaries themselves, such as Mackay's From Far Formosa, as well as compendiums published by the PCT, such the volumes that contain the "North Formosa Mission Reports". Peripheral or less known sources include The China Medical Missionary Journal, 1887-1900s and books such as "The diseases of China" by medical missionaries J.L. Maxwell and W.H. Jefferys. What I present below is only a portion of the results from the third stage pointed above.

The materials collected from the types of sources described above were used to answer the main research question: what techniques of the self were at work in the Presbyterian missions in 19th century Taiwan? The analysis' temporal scope is the period between the establishment of the first English mission in the south of Taiwan (1865) to the year when the Japanese colonial government begins in the island (1895). Attention is paid not only to the main individuals in the mission, that is, the foreign missionaries, but also to the missions' native members.

VI. Preliminary Findings

Tribulations –and audiences.

The Latin motto "Nec Tamen Consumebatur" – which roughly translates into "And yet it was not consumed" – together with the symbol of the burning bush have long been part of the Presbyterian identity (Baille 2008). The tenet goes back to a passage of the Exodus in which God addresses Moses from a bush that is burning yet it is not being destroyed. Undergoing adversity and enduring difficult times has been one of the teachings and principles since the establishment of the first Presbyterian missions in Taiwan (Cheng 2009). Similarly to other Presbyterian churches in Asia and beyond, the PCT today describes itself as a church that at times "has been scorched by the flames of repression and harassment" and yet "still stands faithfully as a light in the darkness and a beacon of hope in the society of Taiwan and the world" (PCT (d)). There are also constant references to the facing of tribulations and adversities and the experiencing of suffering and toiling under harsh circumstances in the documents authored by Maxwell and Mackay as well as other missionaries in the north and south missions. As it is expected, instances of these tribulation in the early years refer to the adversities the newly-arrived missionaries were facing in communities where Christian missions, despite the Dutch attempt at evangelization in the 17th century, were largely alien sights in the landscape. In July 1865, J.L. Maxwell points regretfully in a letter to Dr. Hamilton: "The work which Mr. Douglas and myself had been graciously permitted to commence in Taiwan-foo has been violently interrupted in Taiwan-foo", and goes on:

> Opposition to our presence and labours in the city was first manifested in the form of false and most injurious reports concerning our work [...] These reports, which were even posted in writing on the walls contiguous to the head Mandarin's office, declared that we killed large numbers of people, and secreted their bodies in the upper apartments of the house; that we admitted patients only to fatten and kill them;

> that our medicine [...] would ultimately bring about some frightful evil in the system [...]. (The Messenger, Nov 1, 1865, 358)

In a letter written in Jan 1874 to the convener of the Canadian Presbyterian Church's Foreign Mission Board, G.L. Mackay reports from Tamsui similar trials:

> The enemy issued a placard in which they represented me taking out the eyes and hearts of the people and sending them to England to manufacture opium out of them. I am convinced they have been exerting themselves to induce me to abandon this field […]. (Chen et al., 2012a: 68)

On occasions, the subject undergoing adversity was not necessarily the missionary but the Presbyterian mission as a whole. As Mackay notes in another letter to the Board in 1874 regarding the converts and the mission:

> Not a few have been beaten and their goods plundered. What then? Are we to sit down, ponder over difficulties and abandon the field? God in heaven forbid. Despite all these obstacles, despite all the attacks of the flesh, the world and the devil there are those who stand firm and have already passed through many trials and are this day rejoicing in the Lord (Chen et al., 2012a: 73)

The toiling and suffering of some individuals in the mission was also made public in the missionary's letters. In March 1884, Mackay accounts for the death of a church member as follows:

> Another convert gone home! […]. On a false, base charge was imprisoned [in 18]/76 - I have bundles of letters written in prison - During 8 years of insult, hunger & torture he lived trusting in the Lord Jesus exhorting the prisoners to repent. God be praised! (Chen at al., 2012b: 184)

The missionary's ultimate intention to report their, or the converts', suffering and endurance in the face of adversity could well have been a strategic move to secure funds or at least the trust and sympathy of the Canadian and English Mission Boards' members. But the accounting and sharing of adversities seemed to be done regardless of the role or status of the letter's recipient.

In a personal letter reportedly sent to one of his relatives first and published in *The Messenger* later, missionary Hugh Ritchie wrote on the toiling of an aged convert as follows,

> During his short Christian career he has given us pleasing proofs of the sincerity of his faith and love. His wife so persecuted him on becoming a Christian as to oblige him to go and live by himself, cook his own rice, and submit to a number of petty annoyances. The old man bore this treatment meekly, and in this and other things he has exhibited something like the meekness and gentleness of Christ. (Ritchie et al., 2019: 201)

The facing of adversities and experiencing of suffering seemed to be part of the teachings successfully learnt by the converts too. More importantly, what was also learnt by the converts seemed to be the publication or publicizing of their suffering, the value of suffering, or the willingness to suffer, for different audiences as well. On April 24, 1872, G.L. Mackay refers to the Christian training of his first assistant A-Hôa, who became the first ordained native pastor in the missions. According to Mackay, after the reading of a church hymn A-Hôa was not only "convinced" and "impressed" but also "*declared* he was ready to suffer misery of all kinds if only he could learn more of this heavenly doctrine" (Mackay 2015: 25: emphasis added). In another interesting entry, Mackay writes in February 1884 about the passing away of the church member Lâu-hô and notes how he saw "on [the] grave" of this church member the inscription from the gospel of Timothy: "If we suffer we shall also reign with Him" (Mackay 2015: 389). It can be speculated indeed whether the inscription was the result of the deceased's last wishes, his family's, or even the outcome of the foreign missionary's suggestions. What can be argued, however, is that the inscription on the grave, and A-Hôa's declaration above, were further instances of the usual habit of not only upholding the value of enduring trials and facing adversity but also turning the value and its application into a "public call" directed to different agents within the mission, or audiences outside it.

If we take missionary's diary entries as partly the author's intimate dialogue with God it can be said as well that the latter constituted perhaps the most special type of audience to which mission workers could direct their public/ized experiences of suffering and toils. Mackay's diary entry below, from January 1875, is one among several instances of the missionary's subtle yet evident "publication" of his suffering for God's eyes:

> Did not take a boat, but walked barefooted through city, town and country to Phīⁿ-á-thâu. Retired very late. Met a Foreigner who begged of me to rest. very kind in a sense; but my Lord had a hard time of it. I am amazed when some people say to me "You toil so hard it is easy for you to get saved." &c. &c. Alas! Alas!! How far from my mind — How far? Why like East & West. I have no merit, never will have any. Blessed Jesus Thou art my all and in all (Mackay 2015:160).

What I want to highlight in the evidence above is not the apparently proper occurrence, or successful transmission to the converts, of the Calvinistic spirit of endurance; but the rather normalized practice of sharing one's past tribulations, publicly declaring ones' willingness to suffer; bringing those tribulations or willingness out, and "publishing" them in different formats, with different purposes and for different audiences. On some occasions the public was "earthly", either the members of the church or audiences outside the mission. On other occasions the audience was God itself and the publication occurred in the author's private sphere. If the undergoing and overcoming of tribulations was an expected, and to some extent desirable, event in the life of a Presbyterian subject according to the Calvinist ethos, the public disclosing and/or private sharing of those tribulations before different types of heavenly and earthly publics seemed to be yet another standard practice in Taiwan's presbyterian missions.

Hard work, visible others and "fuzzy" others.

Intense, hard work seemed to be a natural part of mission work for foreign missionaries and a desirable practice among the native pastors too. As native reverend Tân-Hé pointed emphatically about Mackay in a letter to the Canada´s Missions Board written in 1887.

> […] If could write a month without stopping I couldn't tell you of all the toil, labor, and success of our beloved Mackay. We will never, never see a man like him again. […] (Chen et al 2012c: 53)

Labor for evangelization and labor for securing the means for evangelization was indeed what constituted the mission. The intense focus on the mission as a form of productive work can be inferred from the detailed accounts on the numbers of "hearers" and number of "inquirers" in Sunday services; number of baptism in towns and villages; number of chapels and stations built across the island, number of students at schools, as well as number of patients at hospitals that missionaries reported to their respective Boards (e.g. Cheng et al., 2012a: 86; Chen et al., 2012c: 228-29; Mackay 2015: 31, 46, 86, 130, 725; Ritchie et al., 2019: 177-179, 272, 340-45). The reporting was also done by the wives of the missionaries who accounted for their work among other women or at the missions' schools (e.g. Ritchie et al. 364-65). Native pastors' letters included quantitative reports of their work too (e.g. Chen et al. 2012c: 53, 79). Individuals' worth was apparently tied to the quantitative outcomes of their labor. More importantly, this kind of quasi-industrial labor required collaborating or navigating through networks of what can be categorized as *visible others* and *fuzzy others*.

Visible Others

The visible others in the missions comprised native church workers, others Protestant and Presbyterian missions, especially those in mainland China, the consular English authorities as well as the set of local authorities and elites. As early as 1865, Maxwell acknowledged the assistance he was given by "three others engaged in various employments" in the mission; one of them, for instance, was "a master-builder", whose "workmen have nothing to do on the Sabbath" so that they were led "under their master's influence" (The Messenger, No. Jan 1, 1866, 19) to attend Sunday service. As he explains later in another letter those "others" were three Chinese men from Amoy, who were "a source of much comfort" as they were "well fitted for evangelistic work amongst the class" they worked amongst (The Messenger April 2, 1866: 119). More than a decade later in 1876, Scottish missionary William Campbell, from the south mission as well, wrote a letter in which he acknowledges the "valuable aid" of two local men, Pa and Bu-Siong, assigned as "colporteurs" to the mission and its expansion further up north (The Messenger April 1, 1876: 95). As soon as he established in the north, Mackay's evangelization strategies included indeed the training of local assistants (Cheng et al., 2012a: 86), who did not only assist in his preaching tours but also contributed to the "opening" of new missions in strategic areas (Chen et al 2012e: 34).

Regarding visible "others", it is worth recalling too that the Presbyterian missions in Taiwan were part of what can be regarded as a *network* of Presbyterian and Protestant missions in mainland China. The evidence points that the Protestant missions played referential and formative roles in the early training of missionaries and work of the missions. As J.L. Maxwell notes in a letter in 1865, he was "thankful" for meeting the "American brethren of the Methodist Episcopal and American Board Missions" as he had learnt from their work "amidst much opposition and trial", their persistence and "unabated […] love for their work" and their eventual success in the "steady progress" regarding converts for the "visible Church" (The Messenger, No. August 1, 1865: 265). Indeed, before arriving to Taiwan-foo, J.L. Maxwell spend a period of training, preparation and adjustment at the Presbyterian missions of Foo-chow and Swatow in mainland China. As he explains in a latter in 1865, he had found missionaries Mr. Mackenzie and Dr. Gauld and that meeting "encouraged" him "greatly to see on the spot what had been accomplished in so hard a soil as that of Swatow" (The Messenger August 1, 1865, 266).

North-south Presbyterian cooperation in Taiwan took place as well. Although the north and south missions in the island represented different national churches and separate organizational unities, they relied on each other's advice and information. As Maxwell did in mainland China, Mackay spent a training period at Taiwan's south mission with missionaries Maxwell and Ritchie (Ritchie et al., 2019: 175; Chen et al 2012a: 41). On occasions activities at the North mission required communication with and assistance from the missionaries in the south. In January 1874, for instance, Mackay sent a courier to Taiwan-foo and Takao "to get the information about medical and domestic outfit" which the North mission's doctor, missionary James B. Fraser, "desires from Dr. Dickson and Mr. Ritchie" (Chen et al. 2012a: 121) in the south.

In addition the missionaries and church workers in general had to work with, or against, the local authorities, the local elites and the British consular authorities as the missions' performance and productivity also depended on their interactions and negotiations with these parties. One of the many negotiations with local landlords carried out by G.L. Mackay, for instance, can be read in one of his letters to Canada's Foreign Mission Committee, in May 1874:

> I have thought on the subject over & over and I believe the following is the wisest, best, and cheapest thing we can do viz. To buy a site and build as soon as Dr. [Fraser] arrives, [...]. You will notice there a vacant piece between that and the Customs. The owner told me a few weeks ago he would give it to me for $500 or about that. I believe $400 or $500 would purchase it.. [...] (Chen et al.. 2012a: 76)

As pointed above, interactions with the local elites included conflicts as well, particularly in the early years of the missions. In a letter dated March 26th, 1879 and sent to the editor of "Record", Mackay offers a rather triumphalist narrative of one of his first conflicts with members of the island's elites. He starts by pointing out the "bigoted tyrant" who was head of the elite clan in question, how "many a bloody conflict" unfolded by the said tyrant's

appropriation of “land from poor people by force”, and the later succession of the tyrant by his nephew. Referring to the later, Mackay goes on:

> He accused me several years ago of putting up a chapel on his ground. I invited the British consul to go with me to the spot and bring the Mandarin with him. At length all appeared [...] I stretched a rope from one boundary stone to the other and showed all present hat instead of the chapel being on his ground, a house that belonged to him was partly on the chapel ground. The consul [...] went with me at once to the head Yamen to demand justice [...] So this rich man was greatly annoyed at being defeated by a "Barbarian"[…] (Chen et al. 2012b: 20-21)

In one of his letters written in 1867, J.L. Maxwell described not a conflict with elites but a sudden “violent outbreak” by “rioters” who destroyed the mission’s chapel at Takao. In this letter by Maxwell, as in the narrative by Mackay above, another “visible other” appears in the stage: the British consular authorities. Maxwell recalls the intervention of the English consul, Mr Carroll, who reportedly

> “went in amidst heavy rain to Pe-taou, had an interview with the mandarin and demanded not only protection for the chapel, but the seizure of the rioters [...] and the restitution of the stolen property.” (The Messenger, Nov 1, 1867: 337)

The involvement of the consul in missionary activities was not always helpful though, the interaction between the missions and British authorities could also be tense. In 1881 missionary K.F. Junor, who worked alongside Mackay in the north mission, requested the British consul’s intercession to request the intervention of the Chinese authorities regarding an affair that involved one of the local mandarins. In a brief letter, the British consul rejected the missionary’s request on the ground of claims that pointed he had indeed disobeyed local laws. K. F. Junor responded to the consul briefly:

> Sir I am in receipt of yours of yesterday. It contains 3 points given as reason for your refusal to request the intervention of the Chinese authorities in any case that I bring forward. The points are: (1) The Hai Koan accusses me of entering his premises on the 30th of March. (2) The Hai Koan accusses me of ordering a certain Ko-Khing not to obey the Hai-Koan's commands. (3) On the 11th of June I refused to comply with the Hai-Koan's request to produce the man Tiong-sui. It is worthy of notice that the first two are 3 months old. I make answer as to the first, that I have never been in the Hai-Koans premises in my life, either with or without permission. I particularly avoid Yamens. (Chen et al., 2012b: 87)

On occasions, the church correspondence escalated to explicit skepticism and criticism over the British government’s diplomatic strategies. In 1870, J.L. Maxwell criticized the British government’s “failure […] to press” the missionary’s “Treaty rights” and its “untoward and pusillanimous” intentions to break diplomatic relations with the Qing dynasty and withdraw its consular authorities from Chinese territories. In addition, Maxwell pointed three reasons for countering the government’s stance:

> "The enormously increasing export of sugar from the island to the coast and to our own colonies; 2. The actual value of the trading interest of the mercantile firms [...] here and at Tamsui [...]; and 3. The disastrous effect of the shutting up of the Formosa ports upon the trade and prosperity of Amoy [...]" (The Messenger, Sept 1, 1870, 216)

All in all, the expected quasi-industrial productivity of the missions and the missionaries as laborers for Christ, required the former's collaboration and communication with the network of Protestant and Presbyterian missions, and the latter's strategic interaction with the British consular authorities and their navigation through, and negotiations with, the island's elites and Qing authorities. Interestingly, a similar style of "networked" laboring can be found in some of the narratives by the native pastors as well. As reverend Giâm Chheng Hoa explains in one of his letters to G.L. Mackay,

> The other morning when walking on the sea-shore I saw a sailing vessel slowly drifting shoreward and in danger of being wrecked, […]. I asked converts and heathen to go in their fishing boats as quickly as possible and let the sailors know they need not fear savages there, and if they wished to come ashore a chapel would be given them to stay in. The whole crew came ashore in the boats at once. […]. I then hurried away to a Mandarin and asked him to send men to protect the ship and got a Military Mandarin to consent to send soldiers along also […] (Chen et al. 2012d: 52)

Fuzzy others

The spectrum of "others" who were crucial for mission work included another broad category of, mostly female, agents I have preliminarily called "fuzzy others", as their presence seems blurred and their voices appear less frequent than those of the male missionaries. Granted, some of these female agents are increasingly more noticeable as the churches' Boards and Committees of female missionaries, and mission themselves, develop in the early 20th century (e.g. *The Women's…* 1915; Landsborough 1922); though indeed they are represented in a smaller portion of the records from the period before the Japanese colonization. This is the case of the missionary's wives. Other "fuzzy" agents' voices were recorded neither fully nor systematically; though their presence, role and contributions to the missions can be inferred from the missionary's, and other fuzzy agents', accounts; to this sub-category belong the so-called Bible women and the girls and boys in the missions' schools.

References to the work carried out by the missionaries' wives can often be found in the missionaries' letters. As Maxwell points in one of his letters in early January 1870, his wife "occasionally" conducted their "Chinese household worship" and had "a class of four women on four days of each week." (The Messenger, Jan 1, 1870: 11). Though less frequently, these female agents also left their own records. Among these agents, the case of Mrs. Minnie Mackay is relevant. Mrs, Mackay, a local whose Chinese name was Tiuⁿ-Chhang-miâⁿ , married G.L. Mackay in 1878. As it was customary, she became a

housewife in the mission house but also one of Mackay's missionary fellows. In one of her letters from 1887 she touches upon her activities as follows,

> I went with my husband and three children to Bang-Kah; then with A Hoa and several students called on our old Mandarin friend; then we went to the Toa-tiu-tia chapel, and from there to the house of many converts, and to a school in connection with our mission. An elder Dr. Mackay spoke so much about in Canada, and who died some months since, left very lonely family. When we went into the house she wept and cried [...] (North Formosa Mission Reports., s1, vol III, 240)

The work of the missionaries' wives could include a type of emotional labor too. As Anne C.S. Jamieson, wife of missionary John Jamieson, states in a letter written in 1901 in which she ponders about her previous years at Taiwan's north mission:

> If God has used me for the last twenty years it has been I believe to carry "sympathy" to tried ones. I cannot doubt that I have been taken at times hundreds of miles just to give to some beset and burdened worker sustaining sympathy of one who has suffered. […] My very first and most important duty toward Formosa was to cheer and comfort the workers and try to brighten their lives (Chen et al., 2012e: 213)

Less visible, but key as well, was the work carried out by the Native women who were members of the church, usually referred to as Bible women. In one of his letter in 1865, Maxwell subtly acknowledges the contribution of these "helpers" regarding a couple of women in the neighborhood, who "venture within the chapel doors" as a result of the helpers' persuasion (The Messenger, No. Jan 1, 1866, 20). In his book on Formosa and his missionary experiences, Mackay (1895), likely with the help of his editor (Chen et al., 2012e: 76), dedicates a chapter to justify the usefulness of "Bible-woman", an agent that was expected to be "thoroughly familiar with the language and customs of her own people, and [was] trained in the Holy Scriptures so that she can quote and explain with aptness and effect" (1895: 302)

Other agents seldom acknowledged were the native boys and girls at the missions, usually students at the missions' schools. Regarding the work carried out by the girls at the mission's school, Tiuⁿ-Chhang-miâⁿ pointed in a letter in 1887:

> The girls after being taught as long as they can stag [sic], go to their homes to help their parents provide food, or help their husbands when they get married to make a living; then help their own little ones in due time to worship God and be better women and men than their fathers were. (Chen et al., 2012c: 240)

While still working at the north mission, Ann C.S. Jamieson pointed that the students trained at the Girl's school were sent to "to work at different stations [missions] in the country", and even granted that they "will accomplish there more practical good than I or

any other foreign woman could in the same circumstances and with the same surroundings"[3] (Chen et al., 2012d: 93).

Being Christian through/against "Others"

Visible and fuzzy others were not the only crucial agents that substantially assisted or contributed to the missions' evangelization activities. There were alien others or "Others" as well, that is, the native "heathen" population that seemingly represented a separate set of individuals through, and against, which missionaries, converts and church members in general built and/or reinforced their identity as Christians. It seems safe to argue that these "Others" were in a sense produced through processes of othering that went from the utterance or recording of subtle stereotypical references to the public manifestation of prejudice.

In their co-authored volume in the diseases of China medical missionaries J. L Maxwell and W. H. Jefferys (1911) grant that China's population is distributed across different territories and climates, yet do not refrain themselves from referring to this population as an otherwise "homogeneous race" (1911: 52). There is no transversal substantial evidence to argue that Maxwell held prejudicious views on the Chinese, yet in a letter dated 13th August 1870, briefly described the local population in Taiwan as "simpleminded heathen people" (The Messenger, Nov 1, 1870, 265). The missionaries' intentions could be strictly descriptive but the value judgment and the binary separation of the foreign missionaries on one hand and the Chinese on the other persisted. Missionary K. F. Junor in the north mission, for instance, once pointed in a letter in 1878,

> "A Chinaman is a born negotiator. I think it was Sir. Tho[ma]s. Wade who said that he never met diplomatists till he met the Chinese. Skill in intrigue is almost a national characteristic" (Chen et al., 2012a: 210)

This artificial binary distinction could be expressed in terms of "historical stages" and be applied in a relatively self-reflexive way. In 1873, missionary Hugh Ritchie in the south described the "goodly heritage of ordinances" in the British church as those proper of a church of "the nineteenth century, in England", while Christians in Formosa had "more of the simplicity of the first century['s church];" (Ritchie et al., 2019: 252)

Mackay's writings on the one hand show his explicit acknowledgement of the natives' "capabilities […] for Christian service" (e.g. Mackay 1895: 285; see also Chen et al., 2012a:73, 108, 113; 2012b: 17; 2012d: 22, 45; 2012e: 34) and his explicit preference for employing native workers to evangelize and preach to the locals (Mackay 1895: 285-290, 297-307; Chen et al., 2012e: 33). On the other hand, he also showed his stereotypical and on occasions prejudicious views on the island's non-Christians, from the beginning to the end of his missionary career in Taiwan. Soon after his arrival to Taiwan, for instance, he

[33] On this she seems to be going along with Mackay's

writes in a letter about the "idolatry and wickedness and all the abominations of heathenism on every hand" (Chen et al. 2012a: 41) in the island. Almost twenty years later, he reports to Canada's Missions Board that he and his assistants "went from village to village and house to house until the idolatrous paraphernalia of all were put into […] baskets", in such a way that "[n]early (500) five hundred idolaters cleaned their houses of idols […]." (Chen et al., 2012d: 35).

Parallel processes of othering can be observed in the records by/on the native "helpers" as well. In a personal letter cited above, missionary Hugh Ritchie asserts candidly,

> My helpers can scarcely open their mouths without denouncing the folly of idolatry; and although all they say is quite true, such preaching, [...], has invariably an irritating and alienating effect on the native mind. I have stood beside a young man in a crowd, and heard him say such hard things about everything dear to the faith of an idolator as to make me wonder [why] the crowd did not drive us out of the village (Ritchie et at., 2019: 204)

It can be argued that members of the church themselves also asserted their identity as Christians partly through their opposition against, and (re-)creation of, the non-Christian "Others". The passages below are fragments of elder's speeches, likely male elders', recorded in one of Mackay's letters in 1891 –though these fragments certainly underwent Mackay's selective recording, they are useful as proxies of the church members' dichotomic reasoning. An "Elder I" reportedly stated,

> I was village leader, sorcerer, idolater, and gambler -spent all the money I had on a big idol […]. Then went into the city to play confident of winning; but I lost […] Returning home I took the idol by the head and smashed it on a stone &c. Soon there was a fight going on within. Two principles fought hard and the one for Christ won, so I took my stand at once &c (Chen et al., 2012d: 121)

Regarding more severe instances of othering, the record of "Elder B" in Mackay's letter is illustrative; this church member reportedly asserted:

> I am not ashamed to be here and tell you all I worship Jesus of Nazareth. The ignorant, blind and bigoted heathen though really should hide their faces with shame, &c (Chen et al., 2012d: 120)

The church members confronted the non-Christians face-to-face too, likely enacting their artificial separation from them. As native pastor Tan-He noted in one of his letters to Mackay in 1888:

> The Roman Catholics came four times and went into the houses of our people; but every where were met. One old woman a convert silenced everyone of them. God be praised for ever. (Chen et al., 2012c: 79).

VI. Preliminary Conclusions

I have mostly referred above to frequent and apparently systematic practices in the missions, mostly by missionaries, but also by the native pastors, female agents or church members in general. In this sense it is worth underlining that an analysis of "regimes of practices" (Dean 2010: 41) does not only allows the analyst to observe unacknowledged "organizing routines" (Mutch 2016: 82) but can represent evidence of the "processes" whereby "the self is constructed or modified by himself (Foucault 1993: 204), in short, relevant "techniques of the self" (1993: 203). Granted, the practices above do not exhaust the range of techniques of the self that operated in the missions but it is safe to argue they were part of those techniques.

In this sense, the analysis above does not suggest that processes of (self-)reflexive contemplation through the writing of diaries (McKinlay and Mutch 2015) were entirely absent in the government of the mission. Mackay's diary is a perfect case in point. However, whereas this diary contains references to Mackay's moments of meditations (e.g. 2015: 21, 33, 87, 130, 158) the latter do not seem to be acts of self-examination over the individual's potentially sinful sources of thoughts (Foucault 2014). When Mackay writes about his meditations he describes them briefly as directed towards God's "Eternal truth" (2015: 87), "the wonders of the vast creation" (2015: 569) or "God's Eternal promises" (2015: 601). It can be said that these and other passages in Mackay's diary are indeed "deeply melancholic" meditations and perhaps convey to some extent the authors' "deep unease" (McKinlay and Mutch 2015: 244-45). All in all, however, there is no substantial evidence to argue that the self-reflective practice of diary writing was a transversal occurrence in the missions.

The systematic practices referred to above suggest that the formation or shaping of the self in the missions involved at least three types of techniques. Firstly, a formative technique substantially related to the private sharing, or public disclosing, of the self's suffering experience, the value of suffering and/or the willingness to suffer, through different formats and for different audiences (Tilli 2019). Secondly, a particularly agentic technique that revolved around the self's active navigation and productive laboring through networks of agents that included "visible others" in and out of the mission as well as a range of "fuzzy others" within the mission. Thirdly, another type of formative technique that involved both the necessary existence of, and subtle or overt opposition against, alien non-Christian "Others". More importantly, those techniques suggest that self or selves at the missions were constructed and/or shaped not so much through inward-looking regimes of self-examination as through active and passive acts of crossing, traversing and networking with audiences, agents and Others. In other words, The Presbyterian missions' daily government involved a self counter-intuitively constituted and partly conducted *by, through* and *against external subjects and o/Other selves.*

I use above the plural of self deliberately. The evidence confirms tentatively one of the initial presuppositions prior to the analysis. It is not only that the Presbyterian missions implied the orchestration of different nationalities and genders. The missions were sites where different types of roles, profiles and backgrounds coalesced. In this regard we can

point out at least five *types of agents* that have already been named above: the missionary's wife, the native Bible women, the missions' child, the male native pastor, and the foreign male missionary. More importantly, these types seem to represent different types of ontological and formative regimes, or different types of selves, which do not seem to draw evenly on the techniques roughly described above, but very likely embodied *those and other agent-specific techniques* at different degrees and through different combinations.

Regarding the above it is worth pointing out too that the exact and exclusive reproduction of the missionary's regime of self by the native agents in the missions –whether male, female or infant– seems unlikely. In terms of the composition of, and interactions between, different regimes of self, it can be said preliminarily that the native agents in the Presbyterian missions drew as well on other regimes or traditions (Chen 2009; Rohrer 2012) which operated across 19th-century Taiwan's socio-religious dimension and likely provided natives with other techniques –whether Daoist regimes of transforming/transformative self (Komjathy 2007); (neo-)Confucianist traditions of a familial (Gardner 2014; Laliberte 2004), ancestor-based (Chen 2009) or community-aware self (Tu 1985); Buddhist tenets of suffering (Keown 2000) or bodily self (Chang 2016); or other techniques from new and old folk-religion traditions (Weller 1985). Likewise, the foreign missionary´s techniques of self could have been substantially shaped by alternative regimes coming from at least three external sources: the pervasive, and often discussed, anthropologies of the British colonial expansionism in the 19th century (Pels 1997; Qureshi 2011); the explicit and implicit anthropology/ies of 19th-century Western science (Forsberg 2012), as well as the professionalization of the missionary and the quasi-industrial orientation of the Protestant missionary movement of the 19th century in Europe and North America (Semple 2003). Further research on these alternative "native" and "foreign" sources of techniques roughly pointed above can broaden our understanding of both the conduct of the self/selves and the broader government of communities in the Presbyterian missions in 19th-Century Taiwan.

Bibliography.

Alexander, D. (2015). An Unmixed View: The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan and Foreign Missionaries. *神學與教會*, *40*(2), 507-536.

Baille Sandra M. (2008) *Presbyterians in Ireland. Identity in the Twenty-first century*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Band, Edward (1936) *Barclay of Formosa*. Tokyo: Christian Literature Society

Campbell, William (1915). *Sketches from Formosa*. Ch'eng Wen Publishing Company.

Chang, G. (2016). *Protestant missions in late Qing China: George Leslie Mackay's proselytization strategies in Taiwan, 1872-1895*. Master dissertation, Graduate College of the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

Chang, Hung-Chieh (2016). The normalisation of body gifting in Taiwan. *BioSocieties* **11,** 135–151.

Chen Chi-Rong (2009) The early Christian encounter with Taiwan religious culture. Paper presented at the CESNUR Conference, Salt Lake City, Utah, June 11-13, 2009. Access Dec 31st, 2020: https://www.cesnur.org/2009/slc_chen.htm

Chen Kuan-chou; Gamble Louise; Yau Albert; Presbyterian Church in Canada; Presbyterian Church in Taiwan.; Tam King High School.; Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. North Synod (2012a) *North Formosa Mission Reports. G. L. Mackay's Life in North Formosa. 1868-1878. Series 1, Vol. I.* Taipei: Ming Jiaw Publishing & Printing Co.

—— (2012b) *North Formosa Mission Reports. G. L. Mackay's Life in North Formosa. 1879-1884. Series 1, Vol. II*. Taipei: Ming Jiaw Publishing & Printing Co.

—— (2012c) *North Formosa Mission Reports. G. L. Mackay's Life in North Formosa. 1885-1889. Series 1, Vol. III*. Taipei: Ming Jiaw Publishing & Printing Co.

—— (2012d) *North Formosa Mission Reports. G. L. Mackay's Life in North Formosa. 1890-1893. Series 1, Vol. IV*.. Taipei: Ming Jiaw Publishing & Printing Co.

—— (2012e) *North Formosa Mission Reports. G. L. Mackay's Life in North Formosa. 1894-1901. Series 1, Vol. V*. Taipei: Ming Jiaw Publishing & Printing Co.

Cheng, Lien-Min (1965) "A short history of the Presbyterian Church among the mountain tribes in Taiwan", *Occasional Bulletin from the Missionary Research Library* (New York), 16(4-5), 1-19.

Cheng, Yang-en (2009) Calvinism and Taiwan. *Theology Today*, 66, 184-202.

Chou P(2015) *A Study on the missionary activity of Christ Presbyterian church in the Early Post-War Taiwan*, Master thesis, Taiwan Institute of Culture, National Taipei University of Education

Dean, Mitchel (2010). *Govern mentality. Power and Rule in Modern Society*. London: Sage.

Gardner Daniel K (2014) *Confucianism. A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press.

Keith, M. (1912). *Black-Bearded Barbarian*. Missionary Education Movement.

Forsberg Clyde Jr. (2012) "Pan Celtic Anglo-Saxonism, the Polar Eden, and Crossing Racial Divides: The Interesting Case of George Leslie Mackay". In Forsberg Clyde Jr. (ed) *The Life and Legacy of George Leslie Mackay: An Interdisciplinary Study of Canada's First Presbyterian Missionary to Northern Taiwan (1872 – 1901).* Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars. 111-138.

Foucault, Michel (1977). Nietzsche, Genealogy, History. In: D.F. Bouchard (ed.), *Language, counter-memory, practice. Selected essays and Interviews*. New York: Cornell University Press, pp. 139-164.

Foucault, Michel (1978). *The History of Sexuality. Volume I: An Introduction*. New York: Random House.

Foucault, Michel (1993). About the beginning of the hermeneutics of the self, *Political Theory*, 21 (2), pp. 198-227.

Foucault, Michel (2007). *Security, territory, population. Lectures at the College de France 1977-1978*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Foucault, Michel (2008). *The birth of Biopolitics. Lectures at the College de France 1978-1979*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Foucault, Michel, (2010). *The Government of Self and Others. Lectures at the College de France 1982-1983.* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Foucault, Michel. (2011) "Omnes et Singulatim: Towards a Criticism of 'Political Reason'". The Tanner Lectures on Human Values, v. 2. McMurrin Sterling, ed. Salt Lake City; Cambridge: University of Utah, Cambridge University Press

Foucault, Michel, (2014). *On the Government of the Living. Lectures at the College de France 1979-1980.* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Gardella Robert (2015) “From Treaty Ports to Provincial Status”. In Murray A. Rubinstein (ed). *Taiwan: A New History*, Rubinstein. Abigndon; New York: Routledge; East Gate Book, pp.163-200

Gorski Philip (2003) *The Disciplinary Revolution Calvinism and the Rise of the State in Early Modern Europe.* Chicago; London: The University of Chicago Press.

Jefferys Hamilton, Maxwell James (1911*) The diseases of China. Including Formosa and Korea*. London: John Bale, Sons & Danielsson.

Keown Damien (2000) *Buddhism. A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: University of Oxford Press.

Kuo Cheng-Tian (2008) *Religion and Democracy in Taiwan*, New York: State University of New York Press

Laliberte Andre (2004) *The Politics of Buddhist Organizations in Taiwan: 1989–200*. Abingdon: RoutledgeCurzon.

Laliberte Andre (2017) “The Pluralization of the Religious Field in Taiwan and Its Impact on China”, in Tsang Steve (ed) *Taiwan’s impact on China. Why soft power matter more than economic or political inputs,* London: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 203-232.

Landsborough Marjorie (1922) *In Beautiful Formosa*. London: R.T.S.

Lin Christine (1999) “The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan and the Advocacy of Local Autonomy”, *Sino-Platonic Papers*, no. 92, University of Pennsylvania.

Louis Komjathy (2007) *Cultivating Perfection Mysticism and Self-transformation in Early Quanzhen Daoism*. Leiden: Brill.

Mackay, George L. (1895) *From Far Formosa.The Island, its People and Missions*. New Yok: Fleming H. Revell Co.

Mackay, R.P. (1913*) Life of George Leslie Mackay, D.D 1844-1901,* Toronto: Board of Foreign Missions; Student Volunteer Movement for Foreign Missions.

Mackay, George L. (2015) *The Diary of George Leslie Mackay, 1871-1901*. Taiwan: Relic Committee of the Northern Synod of the Taiwan Presbyterian Church; Academia Sinica Institute of Taiwan History; Academia Sinica Digital Center.

Maslákóvá Magdaléna. (2016) Presbyterian Church in Taiwan as a Voice of Powerless Taiwanese Nation: Building Taiwanese National Identity within Public Statements of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan since Martial Law. Conference paper, 13th Annual Conference of the European Association of Taiwan Studies.

Masláková Magdaléna. (2019) Presbyterian Church in Taiwan and Its Political Activism. Conference paper, Christianity and Social Activism in Chinese Societies, February 24-26, 2019, Purdue University.

McKinlay Alan, and Mutch Alistair (2015) 'Accountable creatures': Scottish Presbyterianism, accountability and managerial capitalism, *Business History*, 57:2, 241-256

Molina, J. Michel (2008). Technologies of the Self: The Letters of Eighteenth- Century Mexican Jesuit Spiritual Daughters. *History of Religions*, 47 (4), pp. 282-303

Mutch, Alistair (2015) Pastoral Power and Governmentality: From Therapy to Self Help. *Journal for the Theory of Social Behaviour* 46, 3: 268-285.

Mutch, Alistair (2016) "Decently and order": Scotland and Protestant pastoral power. *Critical Research on Religion*, 5 (1), pp. 79–93.

Nield Robert (2010) Treaty Ports And Other Foreign Stations In China. *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society*, 50, 123-139.

PCT(a), Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, (n.d.) "PCT Administration. Structure and Statistics". Access Dec 4, 2020: english.pct.org.tw/enWho_int_Sta.htm

PCT(b), Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, (1971) "Statement on our national faith."Access Dec 4, 2020: english.pct.org.tw/Article/enArticle_public_19711229.html

PCT(c), Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, (1977) "A declaration on human rights by the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan." Access Dec 4, 2020: english.pct.org.tw/Article/enArticle_public_19770816.html

PCT(d), Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, (n.d.) "PCT Administration. Our Logo". Access December 8th 2020, english.pct.org.tw/enWho_int_Log.htm

Pels Peter (1997) The Anthropology of Colonialism: Culture, History, and the Emergence of Western Governmentality. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 26:1, 163-183

Petterson, Christina (2014). *The Missionary, the Catechist and the Hunter Foucault, Protestantism and Colonialism*. Leiden: Brill

Qureshi Sadiah (2011). *Peoples on parade: Exhibitions, empire, and anthropology in nineteenth century Britain*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Ritchie Hugh, Ritchie Elizabeth, Shufelt John (2019) *The Mission Correspondence of Hugh and Elizabeth Ritchie*. Taipei: National Museum of Taiwan History, Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, Tainan Theological College and Seminary.

Rohrer, J. R. (2008). Charisma in a Mission Context: The Case of George Leslie Mackay in Taiwan, 1872–1901. *Missiology, 36*(2), 227-236.
Rohrer, J. R. (2010). The Legacy of George Leslie Mackay. *International Bulletin of Missionary Research, 34*(4), 221-228.

Rohrer, J.R. (2012) Putting Taiwan's People in the Center of the Story: Reflections on the History of Christian Mission in Taiwan. In Forsberg Jr, C. R. (Ed.). *The Life and Legacy of George Leslie Mackay: An Interdisciplinary Study of Canada's First Presbyterian Missionary to Northern Taiwan (1872–1901).* Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing. 43-56.

Rubinstein Murray (1991) *The Protestant community on Modern Taiwan. Mission, Seminary and Church,* New York; London: East Gate

Rubinstein Murray (2001) The Presbyterian Church in the Formation of Taiwan's Democratic Society", *American Asian Review*, 19(4), 63-95.

Rubinstein Murray (2003) Christianity and Democratization in Modern Taiwan: The Presbyterian Church and the Struggle for Minnan/Hakka Selfhood in the Republic of China. In Clart P. & Jones C. B. *Religion in Modern Taiwan. Tradition and Innovation in a Changing Society.* Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press. Pp. 204-256.

Seitz, Jonathan A. (2016). Unity through shared adversity: a case study of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. *台灣神學論刊,* (42), 131-146.

Seitz, Jonathan (Forthcoming) Taiwan Under Martial Law and Presbyterian Responses (book chapter).

Semple Rhonda A. (2003). *Missionary Women, Gender, Professionalism and the Victorian Idea of Christian Mission*. Suffolk: Boydell Press.

Simon, Scott (2017) "All our relations. Indigenous rights movements in contemporary Taiwan". In Fell Dafydd (ed*) Taiwan's Social Movements under Ma Ying-jeou. From the Wild Strawberries to the Sunflowers*. Abingdon; New York: Routledge. Pp.236-257

The Women's Missionary Society of the Presbyterian Church in Canada (1915) *The Story of Our Missions*. [Canada]: [n.p.]

Tilli, Jouni (2019). Preaching as master's discourse. A Foucauldian interpretation ofLutheran pastoral power. *Critical Research on Religion*, 7 (2), pp. 113–129

Tseng, Y. C., Chang, K. C., Mii, F. K., & Chien, C. W. (2015). From Invisible to Visible: The Evolution of Space Formation of the Nineteenth Century Christian Missionary Work in Taiwan. In *International Conference on Cross-Cultural Design* (pp. 392-402). Springer, Cham.

Tu Wei-ming (1985) *Confucian thought. Selfhood as creative transformation*. Albany: State University of New York Press.

Van Die Marguerite (2012) ""Growing Up Presbyterian in Victorian Canada": Childhood Influences and Faith Formation". In Forsberg Jr, C. R. (Ed.). *The Life and Legacy of George Leslie Mackay: An Interdisciplinary Study of Canada's First Presbyterian Missionary to Northern Taiwan (1872–1901)*. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 21-42.

Wang, Wang-Huei L., Hong-Hsin Lin, and Jung-Der Wang. (1999) "Theology of Calvin and the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan." *台灣神學論刊* 21 149-167.

Weber Max (2001) *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*. London; New York: Routledge.

Weller, Robert P. (1985). Bandits, beggars, and ghosts: The failure of state control over religious interpretation in Taiwan. *American ethnologist*, 12(1), 46-61.

.